

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS



Open Access, Refereed Journal Multi-Disciplinary
Peer Reviewed

www.ijlra.com

DISCLAIMER

No part of this publication may be reproduced or copied in any form by any means without prior written permission of Managing Editor of IJLRA. The views expressed in this publication are purely personal opinions of the authors and do not reflect the views of the Editorial Team of IJLRA.

Though every effort has been made to ensure that the information in Volume II Issue 7 is accurate and appropriately cited/referenced, neither the Editorial Board nor IJLRA shall be held liable or responsible in any manner whatsoever for any consequences for any action taken by anyone on the basis of information in the Journal.

Copyright © International Journal for Legal Research & Analysis

EDITORIALTEAM

EDITORS

Dr. Samrat Datta

Dr. Samrat Datta Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Samrat Datta is currently associated with Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Datta has completed his graduation i.e., B.A.LL.B. from Law College Dehradun, Hemvati Nandan Bahuguna Garhwal University, Srinagar, Uttarakhand. He is an alumnus of KIIT University, Bhubaneswar where he pursued his post-graduation (LL.M.) in Criminal Law and subsequently completed his Ph.D. in Police Law and Information Technology from the Pacific Academy of Higher Education and Research University, Udaipur in 2020. His area of interest and research is Criminal and Police Law. Dr. Datta has a teaching experience of 7 years in various law schools across North India and has held administrative positions like Academic Coordinator, Centre Superintendent for Examinations, Deputy Controller of Examinations, Member of the Proctorial Board



Dr. Namita Jain

Head & Associate Professor

School of Law, JECRC University, Jaipur Ph.D. (Commercial Law) LL.M., UGC -NET Post Graduation Diploma in Taxation law and Practice, Bachelor of Commerce.

Teaching Experience: 12 years, AWARDS AND RECOGNITION of Dr. Namita Jain are - ICF Global Excellence Award 2020 in the category of educationalist by I Can Foundation, India. India Women Empowerment Award in the category of "Emerging Excellence in Academics by Prime Time & Utkrisht Bharat Foundation, New Delhi. (2020). Conferred in FL Book of Top 21 Record Holders in the category of education by Fashion Lifestyle Magazine, New Delhi. (2020). Certificate of Appreciation for organizing and managing the Professional Development Training Program on IPR in Collaboration with Trade Innovations Services, Jaipur on March 14th, 2019



Mrs.S.Kalpana

Assistant professor of Law

Mrs.S.Kalpana, presently Assistant professor of Law, VelTech Rangarajan Dr.Sagunthala R & D Institute of Science and Technology, Avadi. Formerly Assistant professor of Law, Vels University in the year 2019 to 2020, Worked as Guest Faculty, Chennai Dr.Ambedkar Law College, Pudupakkam. Published one book. Published 8Articles in various reputed Law Journals. Conducted 1Moot court competition and participated in nearly 80 National and International seminars and webinars conducted on various subjects of Law. Did ML in Criminal Law and Criminal Justice Administration. 10 paper presentations in various National and International seminars. Attended more than 10 FDP programs. Ph.D. in Law pursuing.



Avinash Kumar



Avinash Kumar has completed his Ph.D. in International Investment Law from the Dept. of Law & Governance, Central University of South Bihar. His research work is on "International Investment Agreement and State's right to regulate Foreign Investment." He qualified UGC-NET and has been selected for the prestigious ICSSR Doctoral Fellowship. He is an alumnus of the Faculty of Law, University of Delhi. Formerly he has been elected as Students Union President of Law Centre-1, University of Delhi. Moreover, he completed his LL.M. from the University of Delhi (2014-16), dissertation on "Cross-border Merger & Acquisition"; LL.B. from the University of Delhi (2011-14), and B.A. (Hons.) from Maharaja Agrasen College, University of Delhi. He has also obtained P.G. Diploma in IPR from the Indian Society of International Law, New Delhi. He has qualified UGC – NET examination and has been awarded ICSSR – Doctoral Fellowship. He has published six-plus articles and presented 9 plus papers in national and international seminars/conferences. He participated in several workshops on research methodology and teaching and learning.

ABOUT US

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS
ISSN

2582-6433 is an Online Journal is Monthly, Peer Review, Academic Journal, Published online, that seeks to provide an interactive platform for the publication of Short Articles, Long Articles, Book Review, Case Comments, Research Papers, Essay in the field of Law & Multidisciplinary issue. Our aim is to upgrade the level of interaction and discourse about contemporary issues of law. We are eager to become a highly cited academic publication, through quality contributions from students, academics, professionals from the industry, the bar and the bench. INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS ISSN 2582-6433 welcomes contributions from all legal branches, as long as the work is original, unpublished and is in consonance with the submission guidelines.

THE RESERVATION SYSTEM IN INDIA: AN ANALYTICAL OVERVIEW

AUTHORED BY - AKSHAT EKNATH HEGDE

Reservation is not an end but a means - a means to secure social and economic justice...
Reservation should not continue for an indefinite period to become a vested interest.

-Justice Pardiwala.

Introduction:-

¹The reservation system in India represents a significant affirmative action framework aimed at promoting social equity and addressing historical injustices. Rooted in the Indian Constitution, the system provides quotas for historically marginalized groups such as Scheduled Castes (SCs), Scheduled Tribes (STs), and Economically Weaker Sections (EWS) in educational institutions, government jobs, and political representation. This article explores the historical context, current structure, debates, and future directions of the reservation system.

Historical Context

²The reservation system was introduced to rectify the deep-seated social inequalities perpetuated by India's caste system. This system is a response to the systemic discrimination faced by certain castes and tribes. The Indian Constitution, particularly Articles 15 and 16, provides a legal foundation for these affirmative action policies, allowing for special provisions to uplift disadvantaged communities.

Reservation policies have evolved. Initially aimed at providing educational and employment opportunities, these policies have been expanded and modified through various amendments and judicial rulings to better address the needs of these communities. The Mandal Commission, appointed in 1978, played a crucial role in shaping the reservation framework by identifying socially and educationally backward classes and recommending a 27% quota for Other Backward Classes (OBCs) in government jobs.

¹ IJCRT editor in Cheif, JOURNAL UGC-CARE IJCRT (ISSN: 2320-2882): UGC APPROVED JOURNAL: <https://ijcrt.org/>. (last visited Sep 6, 2024).

² PRATIKSHA Singh, PROJECT REPORT ON RESERVATION IN INDIA MUMBAI ... (2020), <https://www.drnishikantjha.com/papersCollection/RESERVATION%20IN%20INDIA.pdf>. (last visited Sep 5, 2024).

Current Structure:-

The reservation system is multifaceted, encompassing various domains such as education, employment, and political representation. In education, reservations ensure that SCs, STs, and OBCs have access to seats in government and private institutions. Similarly, in employment, quotas are set aside in government jobs to enhance representation from these groups. The reservation system also includes political representation through reserved seats in legislatures and local bodies.

³Recent legislative changes include the Constitutional (103rd Amendment) Act of 2019, which introduced a 10% reservation for EWS in educational institutions and government jobs, in addition to the existing quotas. This amendment reflects an attempt to address economic backwardness alongside caste-based reservations, though it has also stirred debates about its implications.

Debate and Criticism:-

⁴The reservation system has been a subject of extensive debate. Critics argue that the system may perpetuate caste identities and may not adequately address the needs of the most disadvantaged. Some suggest that reservation policies can create divisions and foster animosity among different communities. Studies have indicated that while reservations have improved access to education and employment for some, inequalities persist, and the system may not effectively target the most economically disadvantaged.

A significant critique is the notion of the 'creamy layer,' which refers to the relatively better-off individuals within reserved categories who benefit from reservations. The Supreme Court, in the **Indra Sawhney case (1992)**, addressed this by limiting reservations to initial appointments and excluding promotions. The Court also established that the combined reservation for SCs, STs, and OBCs should not exceed 50% of the total available seats.

The reservation system is also scrutinized for potentially encouraging a preference for backwardness rather than progress. Critics argue that this could lead to a stagnation in social

³ PRATI KSHA Singh, PROJECT REPORT ON RESERVATION IN INDIA MUMBAI ... (2020), <https://www.drnishikantjha.com/papersCollection/RESERVATION%20IN%20INDIA.pdf>. (last visited Sep 5, 2024).

⁴ Reservation in India,:: Drishti IAS Coaching in Delhi, Online IAS Test Series & Study Material, <https://www.drishtiiias.com/printpdf/reservation-in-india>. (last visited Sep 6, 2024).

mobility and hinder meritocracy. Instead, they advocate for financial aid and other forms of support to help underprivileged individuals advance without relying solely on reservation quotas.

Impact on Society:-

The effectiveness of the reservation system in achieving its intended goals has been mixed. On one hand, reservations have facilitated access to education and employment for marginalized groups, contributing to increased representation in various sectors. Research shows improvements in educational attainment and employment rates among SCs, STs, and OBCs. On the other hand, persistent inequalities and criticisms highlight the need for a more nuanced approach. Some studies suggest that while reservations have opened doors for many, they have not fully addressed the underlying economic and social disparities. The ongoing debate underscores the need for a balance between affirmative action and merit-based criteria.

⁵Future Directions:-

As India continues to grapple with issues of social equity, the reservation system requires ongoing evaluation and potential reform. Future research and policy discussions are focusing on several key areas:

1. **Effectiveness and Impact:** Assessing the real impact of reservations on socio-economic conditions and identifying areas where the system may fall short.
2. **Economic vs. Caste-Based Reservations:** Evaluating the implications of combining economic backwardness with caste-based reservations and determining the most effective way to address both dimensions of disadvantage.
3. **Flexibility and Adaptation:** Exploring flexible approaches that can adapt to changing socio-economic dynamics and address emerging challenges.
4. **Merit and Equity:** Striking a balance between maintaining merit-based criteria and ensuring equitable opportunities for all individuals, regardless of caste or economic status.

⁵ Abdul Kareem, (PDF) An evaluation of the reservation system in India An Evaluation of the Reservation System in India (2023), https://www.researchgate.net/publication/375866518_An_Evaluation_of_the_Reservation_System_in_India. (last visited Sep 5, 2024).

Conclusion:-

In conclusion, the reservation system in India has undeniably made substantial progress in advancing social equity by providing marginalized communities with enhanced access to education, employment, and political representation. However, its complexities and evolving nature necessitate ongoing scrutiny and refinement. The system, while designed to address historical injustices and social disparities, must continually adapt to meet the dynamic needs of a diverse society.

Current debates highlight the necessity of a nuanced approach that balances both caste-based and economic factors. The integration of economic criteria into the reservation framework through recent amendments reflects an attempt to broaden the scope of affirmative action. Nonetheless, this shift requires careful implementation to ensure that it effectively targets those most in need without undermining meritocratic principles.

Future reforms should focus on addressing persistent inequalities and improving the system's efficiency. This involves evaluating the real impact of reservations on socio-economic conditions, mitigating criticisms related to the 'creamy layer,' and fostering an environment where merit and equity coexist. A thoughtful and flexible approach, combined with a commitment to both social justice and individual merit, will be essential in refining India's affirmative action policies and ensuring they serve all citizens effectively.

References:-

- Bikash Dihingia, VIEW OF THE POLICY OF RESERVATION: A STUDY ON THE RELEVANCE OF CASTE-BASED RESERVATIONS IN HIGHER EDUCATION OF INDIA (2021), <https://www.tojqj.net/index.php/journal/article/view/9188/6533>. (last visited Sep 6, 2024).
- IJCRT editor in Cheif, JOURNAL UGC-CARE IJCRT(ISSN: 2320-2882): UGC APPROVED JOURNAL: <https://ijcrt.org/>. (last visited Sep 6, 2024).
- PRATIKSHA Singh, PROJECT REPORT ON RESERVATION IN INDIA MUMBAI ... (2020), <https://www.drnishikantjha.com/papersCollection/RESERVATION%20IN%20INDIA.pdf>. (last visited Sep 5, 2024).

Reservation in India,:: DRISHTI IAS COACHING IN DELHI, ONLINE IAS TEST SERIES & STUDY MATERIAL, <https://www.drishtias.com/printpdf/reservation-in-india>. (last visited Sep 6, 2024).

Abdul Kareem, (PDF) AN EVALUATION OF THE RESERVATION SYSTEM IN INDIA AN EVALUATION OF THE RESERVATION SYSTEM IN INDIA (2023), https://www.researchgate.net/publication/375866518_An_Evaluation_of_the_Reservati_on_System_in_India. (last visited Sep 5, 2024).

